

## TOWN OF ORO VALLEY

### CONCEPTUAL DESIGN REVIEW BOARD

MEETING DATE: September 13, 2011

---

**TO:** CONCEPTUAL DESIGN REVIEW BOARD

**FROM:** David A. Williams, AICP, Planning Division Manager

**SUBJECT:** **Conceptual Design Review for Casa de la Luz** consisting of a Conceptual Site Plan (OV1211-02) and Conceptual Architecture (OV1311-13). Property is located at 7740 and 7750 N. Oracle Road, north of Suffolk Hills Drive.

#### **SUMMARY:**

This project entails development on two adjacent parcels. Two new buildings are proposed on a northern lot, and an existing building on the southern lot will be renovated. All three buildings will be occupied by Casa de la Luz, a hospice service provider. Access to the site is from an existing driveway on N. Oracle Road. This is a “transitional project”; the plans include more detail than is required for a Conceptual Site Plan. Substantial detailed design effort has been expended, so a Final Site Plan submittal is not required.

This review entails both the site plan and conceptual architecture. Public art is not included in this review, and will be reviewed at an upcoming CDRB meeting. The CDRB review is focused on the fundamental elements of the design, including: site layout; circulation; parking; landscape concept; and conceptual grading and drainage information. The information must be sufficient to demonstrate that the design concept is achievable and to ensure community fit.

This report contains staff analysis and proposed conditions of approval and suggested motions for the site plan and conceptual architecture. The Conceptual Design Principles in Section 22.9.D.5 of the Zoning Code are utilized as primary guidance for Staff and CDRB evaluation of the applications. The Addendum A Design Standards are used as secondary guidance, as appropriate.

#### **SECTION I: BACKGROUND**

##### Site Conditions

- Zoning is R-S Residential Service District
- Site is two acres: northern parcel is 1.1 acres and southern parcel is .9 acres
- Proposed use is Medical Office
- Northern parcel is currently vacant and undeveloped
- Southern parcel was developed under Pima County standards and includes a 10,392 square foot building, parking, and landscaping.
- The site slopes at approximately 4% from the northeast down to the southwest corner, resulting in a fifteen (15') foot grade change.

## Proposed Improvements

- Two medical office buildings (2,723 and 4,677 square feet)
- Maximum building height is twenty-five (25') feet or two stories. The proposed height is eighteen feet, six inches (18'-6") and one story.
- 34 parking spaces
- Landscape concept includes:
  - Native plants salvaged from the site, including two saguaros
  - Required buffer plantings for front, side, and rear of property
  - Five foot high screen wall at rear property line
  - Landscaped courtyard area
- Rainwater harvesting basins located in front and rear buffers and landscape island

## Approvals to Date

- April 2003: Property was annexed and R-S Residential Service District Zoning was applied.

## Surrounding Land Uses

<i>Direction</i>	<i>Zoning</i>	<i>Land Use</i>
North:	R-S Residential Service District	Veterinary office
South:	R-S Residential Service District	Day Care center
East:	R1-36 Single Family Residential District	Single family homes
West:	C-2 Commercial	Oracle Crossing shopping center

## **SECTION II: CONCEPTUAL SITE PLAN**

### A. Oro Valley Zoning Code Conceptual Site Design Principles, Section 22.9.D.5.a.

The Conceptual Site Plan is in substantial conformance with all applicable Zoning Code requirements, including the following Conceptual Site Design Principles. Following are key Design Principles (*in italics*), followed by staff evaluation of how the site design addresses the principles:

1. *Building orientation: the location, orientation and size of structures shall promote a complementary relationship of structures to one another.*

The new buildings have been placed and oriented on the site to relate to each other. The site is long and narrow, and does not provide much flexibility for site layout. The angles on the new buildings create interest and serve to frame the courtyard space. It is preferable to have the two smaller buildings, rather than a single large one, because the interior space frames the courtyard area. There will be a public entryway to the existing building from the courtyard.

2. *Drainage/grading: site grading shall minimize impacts on natural grade and landforms and provide for subtle transitions of architectural elements to grade. Significant cuts and fills in relation to natural grade shall be avoided or minimized to the extent practical given property constraints.*

The site slopes from east to west and is lower than the adjacent neighborhood to the east. The grading concept places the buildings on a lower finished grade similar to the existing building. View impacts to adjacent homes to the east are minimal. The 4% slope is minor, and no major cuts or fills will be required.

3. *Connectivity: strengthen the usability and connectivity of the pedestrian environment internally and externally by enhancing access to the public street system, transit, adjoining development and pedestrian and bicycle transportation routes. Where appropriate, buildings and uses should provide access to adjacent open space and recreational areas.*

The internal pedestrian facilities for this project are intended to bring visitors and employees from the parking areas to the main entry ways located in the central courtyard area. There is no perimeter walkway around the complex. There are no existing public sidewalk facilities along Oracle Road, and no future plans for such facilities using private property. For this reason, Staff did not request that public sidewalks be provided. There are existing transit stops to the north and south of this development. There are no adjacent open space or recreational resources in the vicinity of the site.

## B. Addendum A Design Standards

The following Design Standards are relevant to this project:

- Section 2.1.B.e. *Building orientation, Massing, and View Preservation: Building to create protected outdoor dining or public gathering spaces between buildings.*

Two new structures are proposed, so the facility will be comprised of three structures. The arrangement of the two new buildings creates a central courtyard in between the three buildings, and also creates a small, campus-style setting.

- Section 2.1.C.1., *Developments shall provide well defined major entrances to enhance circulation, establish unified project identity and create a sense of arrival.*

These buildings are arranged to create a central courtyard. There are no entryway features that might help to direct visitors to the public entry ways located in the central courtyard. Additional architectural design features should be used to direct visitors to this preferred entry area. A condition has been added to Part II of Exhibit "A" to address this standard.

- Section 2.3.B. *Landscape Themes and Character. Landscaping shall enhance visual character and provide amenities for pedestrians.*

The Landscape Plan meets this standard by the following: utilizing salvaged native specimen plants; accentuating building and project entrances with landscaping; and using trees and plant materials to create shade for pedestrians.

- Section 2.2.G. *Public art shall be integrated into the overall design of the project and shall be located in areas of high visibility and use.*

The public art is located at the front of the buildings adjacent to the sidewalk and parking areas, and staff concludes this does not meet the standard. The public art could be located in other areas where it would be better integrated with the building and landscape.

Section 2.2.D.b. *Parking shall be placed to the rear and side of the buildings to the greatest extent possible.*

This standard is generally met. There is a small amount of parking (7 spaces) at the front of the site, and the remainder (27 spaces) is located at the rear.

## D. Engineering Division Comments

### *Drainage:*

Existing runoff is conveyed through the site in a northeast to southwest direction, mostly by natural drainage swales and overland sheet flow. The northern parcel is currently undeveloped with natural desert landscape and drains to an existing channel adjacent to Oracle Road.

Post-developed runoff will be released from the proposed development in a way that mimics existing conditions. The conveyance of runoff through the site will be accomplished by surface flow towards a combination of catch basins and curb openings. A portion of the runoff will be collected within rainwater harvesting basins located throughout the site. Runoff will also be collected within a new detention basin located along the west boundary of the project. The detention basin will attenuate the stormwater discharge so that there is no increase in peak flow or negative impacts to the downstream areas. The detention basin will release stormwater into the existing channel located within the Oracle Road right-of-way.

First flush treatment is provided with this project and consists of filter inserts placed within catch basins and curb openings to treat urban runoff. First flush filters are designed to capture sediment, debris, trash, oils, and grease within runoff discharging from parking areas and access drives.

### *Grading:*

A Type 2 Grading Permit will be required for construction of building pads, drainage structures, utilities, parking areas, and all other elements requiring grading on the project site. The grading represented within the Conceptual Site Plan conforms to the requirements of the Town Zoning Code (Section 27.9, Grading) and the Town Subdivision Street Standards and Policies Manual.

### *Traffic:*

A shared use and cross access agreement will allow access to the project site from Oracle Road by means of a single ingress/egress driveway that exists on the adjacent southern parcel. Furthermore, the parking lot layout has been designed to provide vehicular connections with the existing southern parcel along the east and west boundaries. The proposed development provides a one-way drive along the northern boundary, matching the circulation direction of the one-way drive that exists within the southern parcel. The generated traffic resulting from this development will have a minimal impact on Oracle Road. All constructed improvements within the Oracle Road right-of-way will require a separate permit issued from the Arizona Department of Transportation.

## **CONCLUSION/RECOMMENDATION:**

Site layout options are limited for this small parcel. Based on this review of relevant standards, staff finds that the Conceptual Site Plan is in relative conformance with the Design Principles and applicable Design Standards. The proposed development is adequately screened from the homes to the east by a wall and landscaping, and will be generally compatible with the existing area. Staff recommends approval of the Conceptual Site Plan subject to the attached Conditions.

## **SUGGESTED MOTION:**

The CDRB may wish to consider one of the following suggested motions:

I move to recommend [approval, approval with conditions, OR denial] Conceptual Site Plan for Casa de la Luz, subject to the conditions of Part I of Exhibit "A".

## SECTION III: CONCEPTUAL ARCHITECTURE

### A. Oro Valley Zoning Code Conceptual Architectural Design Principles, Section 22.9.D.5.b.

The Conceptual Architecture is not in conformance with some of the following Conceptual Architectural Design Principles. Staff have proposed conditions to meet Conceptual Architectural Design Principles and Standards. Following are the Design Principles (*in italics*) followed by staff evaluation of how the architecture conforms and responds to the principles:

1. *Design: building architectural design shall be appropriate for the climate and characteristics of the Sonoran Desert, including indigenous and traditional textures, colors, and shapes found in and around Oro Valley. All development shall maintain and strengthen the high quality of design exemplified in Oro Valley through project creativity and design excellence.*

The proposed architectural design for the two new buildings must blend with the existing structure. The design incorporates the Territorial and Spanish Colonial features of the existing building, both appropriate Sonoran Desert styles. Some aspects of the design could be improved. The new buildings incorporate some features from the existing structure to the south. Additional architectural elements should be added to enhance and strengthen compatibility as well as overall design, including articulation of facades and highlighting of public entryways. The design is consistent with other commercial and residential design in the area.

2. *Scale, height and mass: building scale, height and mass shall be consistent with the town-approved intensity of the site, designated scenic corridors, and valued mountain views. Buildings shall be designed to respect the scale of adjoining areas and should mitigate the negative and functional impacts that arise from scale, bulk and mass.*

The project area includes single-family and neighborhood scale commercial and service development. The scale, height, and mass of the proposed buildings is appropriate to the site and area, and meets Zoning Code requirements. It is difficult to confirm the precise height of the new buildings; height must be clearly indicated on the elevations and sections. As viewed from Oracle Road, there should be some areas of consistency in roof height between the new and existing buildings. Conditions have been added to address these requirements.

3. *Façade articulation: all building facades shall be fully articulated, including variation in building massing, roof planes, wall planes, and surface articulation. Architectural elements including, but not limited to; overhangs, trellises, projections, awnings, insets, material, and texture shall be used to create visual interest that contribute to a building's character.*

Additional architectural features would enhance the building articulation. This is discussed in more depth under Design Standards.

The renderings provided do not show varied rooflines (parapets), but the building sections do. Variation in the roofline would help meet this Standard. The building sections should be revised to be consistent with the renderings. A condition has been added to address this requirement.

4. *Screening: building design and screening strategies shall be implemented to conceal the view of loading areas, refuse enclosures, mechanical equipment, appurtenances, and utilities from adjacent public streets and neighborhoods.*

The homes to the east are at a higher elevation than the project site. The parapet height of the proposed buildings must be sufficient to conceal mechanical equipment and appurtenances as viewed from public streets and by neighbors. A condition has been added to confirm that this requirement has

been met. A landscaped, five foot high screen wall is included to screen parking from neighbors to the east.

Refuse areas must be screened with a 6-foot opaque screen painted to match the buildings. The design does not include details for this screening. A condition has been added to address this requirement.

## B. Addendum A Design Standards

The following Design Standards are relevant to this project:

- Section 2.2.A.1.a.1. and 2., *Buildings shall be designed at the ground or pedestrian level to provide human scale. This may be achieved by using the appropriate sizing and locations of openings, level of architectural detail, articulation and use of textures.*

*Building design shall reflect consideration of superior and desirable design elements of adjacent development when applicable and appropriate.*

The existing building has a massed brick archway feature at the front entrance. The location of the public entry ways to the new buildings (through the courtyard) are not enhanced or called out by the architectural design. In addition, the architectural design at the existing building utilizes solid brick as a massing element, rather than wainscoting. Applying such features to the new buildings would enhance the design. Staff added a condition to require that architectural elements be added to enhance the entry points to the courtyard and new buildings, and that some brick massing elements be included.

- Section 2.2.A.1.b. *Project design shall consider and integrate all elements by: (1) Provide consistent architectural treatments, articulation, and fenestration to present a coherent design theme for all sides of a building.*

The features of the new building should be consistent with those of the existing building. For instance, the column proportions of the new buildings appear narrower than the existing ones. Also, Sheet M.2. reads “windows to match existing,” but the window indicated in the new buildings elevations has substantially more detail. Additional detail is beneficial if the styles are consistent. Staff added a condition to require that these be addressed.

- Section 2.2.B.3, *Rooftop mechanical equipment shall be screened or installed in a manner to fully conceal and to prevent obstruction or distraction of other views. Screening shall be consistent with building design. Materials and color shall be of low reflectivity.*

The conceptual elevations do not indicate where rooftop mechanical equipment will be installed and how it will be screened. A rooftop parapet is provided, and must be sufficient to conceal the mechanical equipment from view from residences and public streets. Staff added a condition to require that this be added.

- Section 2.2.E12, *At least three (3) substantially different materials shall be utilized on all facades of the building.*

Only two (2) materials are proposed: painted stucco and brick. Additional materials will add interest to the design. Staff added a condition to Part II of Exhibit “A” to require that a third substantially different material is used.

**CONCLUSION/RECOMMENDATION:**

The Conceptual Architecture is not in substantial conformance with the Design Standards. Any recommendation for approval should be subject to the attached conditions.

**SUGGESTED MOTION:**

The CDRB may wish to consider one of the following suggested motions:

I move to recommend [approval, approval with conditions, OR denial] Conceptual Architecture for Casa de la Luz, subject to the attached conditions.

**SECTION IV: PUBLIC NOTIFICATION AND COMMENT:**

Notice to the public was provided consistent with Town-adopted noticing procedures, which includes the following:

- Notification of residents within 600 feet
- Posting on property
- Notice in Daily Territorial newspaper
- Posting at Town Hall
- All registered HOA's

A neighborhood meeting was held on May 9, 2011. Two residents attended the meeting. The neighbors did not express significant concerns regarding the proposal. To date, no additional comments have been received.

**Attachments:**

1. Conditions of Approval
2. Conceptual Site Plan
3. Conceptual Architecture

cc: Rob Caylor, Caylor Construction

---

David Williams, AICP, Planning Division Manager

**Attachment 1  
Conditions of Approval  
Casa de la Luz**

**Part I: Conceptual Site Plan (OV1211-02)**

Engineering:

1. Address all redlined comments within the Conceptual Site Plan and Water Harvesting Plan.
2. Conceptual Site Plan, Sheet 2: The access drive along the north side of the site has been modified as a one-way access lane from the previous submittal. This creates a dead-end parking lot on the west end of the site for motorists entering from the south. As a result, please provide a turn-around area for motorists. This can be accomplished by striping out the last parking space.
3. Conceptual Site Plan, Sheet 2: Indicate that "ONE-WAY, DO NOT ENTER" signage will be provided at the west end of the one-way access drive. Furthermore, it is recommended that the drive be narrowed to 20'-wide at this location to make it more obvious to motorists that the drive is for exiting one-way traffic only.
4. Rainwater Harvesting Plan: Verify the total volume of rainwater harvesting provided for this project. Sheet one indicates 536 cubic feet of volume will be provided but sheet 2 and the Drainage Report indicate that 500 cubic feet will be provided. Revise as necessary.

Planning:

1. Conceptual Site Plan must be revised to show final location of public artwork.
2. Conceptual Site Plan must adequately address staff comments in August 23, 2011 letter.
3. Parking must be updated to reflect loss on one space at front of building.

## **Part II: Conceptual Architecture (OV1311-13)**

1. Revise S.1 Site Sections and provide building heights so that parapet height of new buildings is varied, while also allowing for adequate parapet height to screen mechanical.
2. Clearly indicate proposed building heights around roofline on the elevations and sections.
3. The building rooftop design should be revised to be consistent in all plans.
4. Provide scaled section drawings that show the sight line from residences to east and Oracle Road. Include mechanical equipment and show that the parapet height is sufficient to conceal the mechanical equipment and appurtenances from public streets and neighbors.
5. The final architectural plans shall include details for screening for refuse areas with a 6-foot opaque screen of materials and colors that match the buildings.
6. Revise the column of the new buildings to match the columns on existing building.
7. Architectural elements that will help direct visitors to the courtyard and public entryways, such as piers or archways, should be added.
8. Massing elements should be added to enhance building articulation.
9. Color specifications must indicate light reflectivity value of rooftop material.
10. Final architectural plans shall indicate that each element of the architectural elevations has been identified with the colors and materials that are used.
11. A third substantially different material must be incorporated into the architectural design.