

TOWN OF ORO VALLEY

CONCEPTUAL DESIGN REVIEW BOARD

MEETING DATE: January 24, 2012

TO: CONCEPTUAL DESIGN REVIEW BOARD

FROM: David A. Williams, AICP, Planning Division Manager

SUBJECT: Conceptual Site Plan, Conceptual Architecture, and Conceptual Public Artwork for LA Fitness, a 45,000 square foot indoor recreation/fitness center located on the northeast corner of Oracle Road and Hardy Road, OV1211-08, OV1311-15, and OV512-01.

SUMMARY:

This project entails development of an indoor recreation/fitness center. Access to the site is provided from two new driveways: one on Oracle Road, and one on Hardy Road.

This review includes Conceptual Site Plan, Conceptual Architecture, and Conceptual Public artwork. The Conceptual Design Review Board (CDRB) review is focused on the fundamental elements of the design, including: site layout; circulation; parking; landscape concept; and conceptual grading and drainage information. The information that is provided must be sufficient to demonstrate that the design concept is achievable, and improve community fit.

The applicant has submitted a request for a grading exception, and the grading exception is required to improve both community fit and site design. The property is located in the Oracle Road Scenic Corridor Overlay District (ORSCOD), a designated scenic corridor with additional zoning requirements. Two neighborhood meetings were held, and the outcome of those meetings is discussed in more detail in Section II.

This report contains staff analysis, proposed conditions of approval and suggested motions for the Conceptual Site Plan, Conceptual Architecture, and Conceptual Public Artwork. The Conceptual Design Principles in Section 22.9.D.5 of the Zoning Code are utilized as primary guidance for Staff and CDRB evaluation of the applications. The Addendum A Design Standards are used as secondary guidance, as appropriate.

SECTION I: BACKGROUND

Site Conditions

- Zoning is C-1 Commercial
- Site is 8.5 acres
- Proposed use is fitness center/indoor recreation
- The property is currently vacant and undeveloped
- The site slopes from the northeast to the southwest corner, resulting in a grade change of 51 feet
- A locally designated floodplain extends across the southwest portion of the site

Proposed Improvements

- One-story, 45,000 square foot building
- Proposed height:
 - 25 foot high building with a 10 foot high architectural element

- Allowed height:
 - 25 feet
 - Architectural elements may exceed building height requirement by no more than ten (10) feet, subject to approval by the CDRB
- The project meets the ORSCOD setback requirements (60 foot minimum and 4:1 setback to height) and C-1 Commercial district setback requirements. The following setbacks are proposed:
 - Front: 295 feet
 - Rear: 85 feet
 - Side: (north) 200 feet
 - Side: (south) 105 feet
- 271 parking spaces
- 100 foot significant vegetation preservation zone along Oracle Road
- The Conceptual Landscape Plan includes:
 - Native Plant Salvage and Preservation
 - Ten foot wide landscape area around building
 - Thirty foot buffer with six foot high screen wall and retaining walls at east property line
 - Thirty foot wide buffer at eastern property line
 - Open space areas at the rear and at the northeast corner
 - Landscaped, shaded seating area at the southwest corner of building
 - Drainage improvements include a series of interconnected retention basins to handle the drainage from an existing drainage channel. The basins are located at the south property line adjacent to Hardy Road

Approvals to Date

- April 2008: Town Council conditionally approved a Development Plan and Landscape Plan for Palisades of Oro Valley, a commercial development at the site.
- March 2004: Town Council conditionally approved a Master Development Plan and Specific Development Plan for Eckerd’s Drug Store at the site.

Surrounding Land Uses

Direction	Zoning	Land Use
North	C-1 Commercial	Vacant parcel
South	R-6 Multi-family Residential and C-1 Commercial	Circle K convenience store/gas station, vacant parcel, Sunnyslope Apartments, and single-family homes
East	R1-36, Single Family Residential	Existing single family homes
West	R-6 Multi-family Residential	Overlook at Pusch Ridge Apartments

SECTION II: CONCEPTUAL SITE PLAN

A. Oro Valley Zoning Code Conceptual Site Design Principles, Section 22.9.D.5.a.

The Conceptual Site Plan is in substantial conformance with all applicable Zoning Code requirements, including the following Conceptual Site Design Principles (see Attachment 2). Following are key Design Principles (*in italics*), followed by staff evaluation of how the site design addresses the principles:

1. *Building orientation: the location, orientation and size of structures shall promote a complementary relationship of structures to one another.*

This proposed development includes only one building, so there is not an opportunity to establish relationships between structures on the site. The relationship between the proposed building and other structures in the area must be evaluated; notably, the homes to the east. The finished floor elevation of the proposed building has been lowered which will reduce the visual impact to these homes and promote a more complementary relationship between the proposed building and the homes. Additional reduction in finished floor elevation of two feet has been requested by the neighbors immediately adjacent to the east. See Section B., Design Standards, Land Use Transition, below.

2. *Drainage/grading: site grading shall minimize impacts on natural grade and landforms and provide for subtle transitions of architectural elements to grade. Significant cuts and fills in relation to natural grade shall be avoided or minimized to the extent practical given property constraints.*

The site slopes significantly from the northeast down to the southwest. The proposed 45,000 square foot building is a one-story structure that is designed to occupy a flat area of approximately one acre. During the neighborhood meeting process, the applicant was asked if a floor plan that is designed for different elevations could be considered. Such a split-level floor plan would provide for a more gradual transition between building and grade. The applicant noted that such a design cannot be accommodated by the building program for this indoor fitness center.

During project development, the applicant developed several different grading designs. The design was improved to reduce the amount of cut and fill. This grading design was presented and discussed extensively during the neighborhood meeting process. In order to develop this proposed concept, a grading exception is required. The cut that is required for this concept includes two six foot retaining walls at the rear of the site, and eight to twelve feet of fill with 3-4 foot high retaining walls at the front of the site in an existing drainage area. This extent of cut and fill is considered to be significant; however, in relation to the grading exception, staff concluded that the proposed grading will strike a critical balance between the needs of the proposed development, the desires of the closest neighbors, and Zoning Code requirements. Additional provisions have been incorporated to mitigate the visual impact of the retaining walls. Specifically, the front parking area is terraced so that parking is provided at three different levels, with retaining walls that will be visually mitigated by landscaping. This creates a stepped design to more closely follow the natural contours of the site. At the southwest corner of the site, there is an existing wash where fill is required to establish a more level area that can accommodate a parking area. At the rear of the site, the retaining walls include four foot wide terraces that will be landscaped. The visual impact of and mitigation for the proposed grading design is discussed in more detail in the staff report for the grading exception.

3. *Connectivity: strengthen the usability and connectivity of the pedestrian environment internally and externally by enhancing access to the public street system, transit, adjoining development and pedestrian and bicycle transportation routes. Where appropriate, buildings and uses should provide access to adjacent open space and recreational areas.*

A comprehensive pedestrian network is provided within the project site. Pedestrian connections are provided from all parking areas to the building's main entry way at the western elevation. A paved, meandering sidewalk will be provided along Oracle Road and Hardy Road, with pedestrian connections provided from the sidewalks to the on-site pedestrian facilities. The sidewalk along Oracle Road provides access to an existing transit stop. There are no adjacent open spaces or recreational resources in the vicinity of the site.

B. Addendum A Design Standards

The following Design Standards are particularly relevant to this project:

Section 2.1.A.1. Land Use Transitions. Use of transition in grade to reduce the overall scale of the development on less intense land uses.

This proposed commercial site directly abuts a single-family residential area to the east. During the neighborhood meeting process, much discussion focused on the proposed finished floor elevation and height of the building pad, and potential impacts to these neighbors' views. As noted under the discussion of Conceptual Design Principle 2. above, the building occupies a large, flat area of approximately one acre, which reduces the potential for using grade changes to reduce the scale of the development. Following the first neighborhood meeting, the finished floor elevation of the building was lowered by two feet. Neighbors proposed that the building grade be lowered by two or more additional feet beyond what is currently proposed, which would lessen impact to neighbors' views. The applicant considered this request and determined that the additional construction and earthwork would be too costly to implement.

- *Section 2.1.A. 4. Land Use Transitions. Outdoor activities that produce noise, light, dust, smoke, or odors shall not be placed in proximity to residentially-zoned property.*

To address neighborhood concerns, a minimal amount of parking is provided at the rear of the site, and the area to the rear of the building is designated as open space. This feature was incorporated by the applicant to respond to neighbors' concerns regarding potential noise and light impacts from parking in the rear. A six foot high screen wall with view panels located in the middle of a thirty foot wide landscape buffer at the eastern property boundary was requested by neighbors. In addition, at the neighborhood meetings, the applicant agreed that wall-mounted lighting would be ten feet or lower, and pole-mounted lighting within 150 feet of residential property must be fifteen feet or lower, with cut-off fixtures. Conditions have been added to Attachment 1 to address these items.

- *Section B.2.a. Plot significant view corridors during initial planning to identify primary vistas of the Catalina and Tortolita mountain ranges.*

The site is located in the Oracle Road Scenic Corridor. The 300 foot scenic corridor is defined on the Site Plan, and the building has been located outside of the scenic corridor. The applicant provided an analysis of the development in the Oracle Road Scenic Corridor, and also depicted the proposed development in the corridor (See View Preservation Plan, *Attachment 2*). The analysis indicates that the building does impact the view of foothills of the Catalina Mountains, but does not impact primary vistas of the Catalina Mountain range located to the east and northeast of the project site.

- *Section 2.3.B. Landscape Themes and Character. Landscaping shall enhance visual character and provide amenities for pedestrians.*

The Landscape Plan will incorporate the following:

- Preserve existing vegetation along Oracle Road;
- Utilize salvaged native specimen plants;
- Provide landscaping around the building and at main entryway;
- Use trees and plant materials to create shade for pedestrians in parking areas; and
- Provide buffers at the east and south property lines.

In addition, there are retaining walls at the east and southwest portions of the property. Landscaping will be used in terrace plantings, as well as at the base of retaining walls. Plant types should be selected that include color, visual interest, and height, in order to create focal points and help define pedestrian circulation. A condition has been added to Attachment 1.

The Conceptual Landscape Plan depicts entirely new landscaping along Hardy Road. The neighbors expressed a preference to have native vegetation along the Hardy Road right-of-way retained to the greatest extent feasible. This will require sensitive design of the new drainage way along Hardy Road. A condition has been added to Attachment 1.

- Section 2.1.D.1.c. *Large parking fields shall be broken up into smaller areas through the use of building placement, landscaping, pedestrian walkways, and grade transitions.*

The parking areas to the west (front) and north of the building are terraced and separated with 3-4 foot retaining walls. Landscaping is proposed above the wall to shield views of cars. The grade changes and landscaping will break up the large parking area into smaller areas.

- Section 2.2.J.1.b. Refuse enclosures and service areas shall be located away from residential areas in a manner to reduce visibility of these areas from adjoining streets and property.

The refuse container is located adjacent to the neighborhood to the east. The refuse container should be located further away from the neighborhood; the northwest corner of the northern parking lot is a preferred location. A condition has been added to Attachment 1.

C. Other Zoning Code Requirements

The Conceptual Site Plan was reviewed for compliance with Zoning Code requirements. The applicant must demonstrate compliance with the following:

Off-Street Parking:

- A passenger drop off area must be provided. (Section 27.7.G.4.e.) A condition has been added to Attachment 1.

Conceptual Landscaping:

- A pedestrian area is required, and may be met by providing shaded seating area in a landscaped area (Section 23.8.C.3.). The benches need to function in concert with the landscape design to provide shading. Alternatively, a structural solution may be provided. A condition has been added to Attachment 1.
- A forty-two inch high decorative masonry wall and/or depressed parking, or combination, must be provided for the parking spaces facing Hardy Road. (Section 27.6.C.5.b.xi.) A condition has been added to Attachment 1.
- Building must have a ten foot wide landscape area on all four sides, and it is not clear how this requirement will be met at the western elevation. A condition has been added to Attachment 1.

D. Engineering Division Comments

Drainage:

Existing runoff is conveyed through the site in an east to west direction, mostly by natural drainage swales and overland sheet flow. The site is currently undeveloped with natural desert landscape and drains to a culvert that crosses beneath Oracle Road near the southwest corner of the project boundary.

The drainage system for the proposed development shall be designed to meet the requirements of the Town's Drainage Criteria Manual and Floodplain Ordinance. The developer will design and construct an off-site channel along Hardy Road to collect and re-route off-site drainage to the existing Oracle Road culvert. On-site storm water runoff will be conveyed to a number of detention basins located along the southern boundary of the site. The detention basins will attenuate storm water discharge so that there is no increase in peak flow or negative impacts to downstream areas. The use of rainwater harvesting basins and first flush treatment will be incorporated into the final design in accordance with Town requirements. First flush treatment is designed to capture sediment, debris, trash, oils, and grease within runoff discharging from parking areas and access drives.

Grading:

A Type 2 Grading Permit will be required for construction of building pads, drainage structures, utilities, parking areas, and all other elements requiring grading on the project site. The grading represented within the Conceptual Site Plan does not fully meet the requirements of the Town Zoning Code (Section 27.9, Grading). A request for a grading exception has been concurrently submitted for this project to exceed the cut and fill limitations of the Grading Ordinance.

Traffic:

The proposed development will utilize two access driveways; one along Oracle Road and one along Hardy Road. The driveway along Oracle Road will be limited to right-in/out traffic movements while the Hardy Road driveway is intended to be full access. A traffic impact analysis will be prepared to determine the necessary off-site improvements to Oracle Road and Hardy Road to accommodate the traffic generated by this development. Off-site improvements are likely to consist of Oracle Road widening to accommodate a right-turn lane, Hardy Road widening to accommodate a two-way left turn lane, and re-timing of the signalized intersection for westbound left turns from Hardy Road. Furthermore, a transit pull-out along Oracle Road is a condition of the Grading Exception request to be provided by the developer. Accommodations for future on-site cross access driveway connections with the adjacent parcel to the north are also being provided.

All required off-site roadway improvements shall be the responsibility of the developer. All constructed improvements within the Hardy Road right-of-way shall require a right-of-way permit issued from the Town Engineer's office. All constructed improvements within the Oracle Road right-of-way will require a separate permit issued from the Arizona Department of Transportation.

PUBLIC NOTIFICATION AND COMMENT:

Public notice was provided consistent with Town-adopted noticing procedures, which includes the following:

- Notification of residents in Shadow Mountain Estates East and Sunnyslope
- Posting at Town Hall and website
- All registered HOA's

Neighborhood meetings were held on June 21, 2011 and October 27, 2011. Approximately forty residents attended the first meeting, and approximately twenty residents attended the second meeting. Seven additional comments were forwarded to staff. A list of neighborhood concerns with the applicant's response/agreed upon solution is provided as Attachment 3.

CONCLUSION/RECOMMENDATION:

Based on a review of relevant standards, staff finds that the Conceptual Site Plan is in substantial conformance with the Zoning Code, Design Principles and applicable Design Standards, with the Conditions in Attachment 1. The proposed development is adequately screened from the homes to the south by a six foot high screen

wall and landscaping. During the neighborhood meeting process, the applicant revised the plan to address the majority of the neighbors' concerns. The major, unresolved concern for adjacent neighbors is the finished floor elevation of the building. Staff supports additional lowering of the finished floor elevation; however, staff also recognizes the applicant's development cost implications. Given the challenging topography of the site and the adjustments that have been made to the Conceptual Site Plan, staff concludes that a reasonable balance has been achieved between accommodating development and promoting a complementary relationship with the adjacent homes to promote neighborhood compatibility. Staff recommends approval of the Conceptual Site Plan subject to the Conditions of Approval (Attachment 1, Part I).

SUGGESTED MOTION:

The CDRB may wish to consider one of the following suggested motions:

I move to approve the Conceptual Site Plan for LA Fitness with the Conditions in Attachment 1, Part I, finding that:

- The Conceptual Site Plan meets the applicable Conceptual Site Design Principles.
- The Conceptual Site Plan has sufficiently addressed the neighborhood issues and concerns to improve community fit.

OR

I move to deny the Conceptual Site Plan for LA Fitness, finding that:

- The proposal does not meet the design principles, specifically _____.
- The design has not sufficiently addressed substantive neighborhood issues and concerns, including: _____.

SECTION III: CONCEPTUAL ARCHITECTURE

The proposed building is a 45,000 square foot, twenty-five foot high, one-story building. The building surface is composed of both rough and smooth textured concrete block in three different earth tones. The front entry is framed by a brick veneer massing element, topped by a ten foot high, metal crown-shaped architectural element. The roof parapet is finished with white cornice trim, and white shade devices are provided at windows.

A. Oro Valley Zoning Code Conceptual Architectural Design Principles, Section 22.9.D.5.b.

Following are the Design Principles (*in italics*) followed by staff evaluation of how the architecture conforms and responds to the principles:

1. *Design: building architectural design shall be appropriate for the climate and characteristics of the Sonoran Desert, including indigenous and traditional textures, colors, and shapes found in and around Oro Valley. All development shall maintain and strengthen the high quality of design exemplified in Oro Valley through project creativity and design excellence.*

The architectural design is contemporary and utilizes materials that are consistent with the Territorial architectural style. The design utilizes a series of differing horizontal elements interspersed with vertical elements. The cornice and trim help to break up the extensive façade. The materials include roughly textured block, an appropriate texture for the Oracle Road Scenic Corridor.

2. *Scale, height and mass: building scale, height and mass shall be consistent with the town-approved intensity of the site, designated scenic corridors, and valued mountain views. Buildings shall be*

designed to respect the scale of adjoining areas and should mitigate the negative and functional impacts that arise from scale, bulk and mass.

The building is located in the Oracle Road Scenic corridor. The building scale is comparable in size to the Pulte Office Building (approximately 41,000 square feet); however, the Pulte Building is 30 feet high. The proposed LA Fitness building is of a much larger scale than the single family homes and apartments in the vicinity. The building scale and mass is mitigated by the use of horizontal elements, particularly the cornice and trim. The Oracle Road Scenic Overlay District architectural requirements note that "richer earth tone or geologic textures are preferred." The architectural design incorporates brick and block in both smooth and rough textures, in earth tone colors, which is consistent with this principle.

The proposed design includes a twenty-five foot high building with a ten foot high, metal architectural element. The ten foot high architectural element is not consistent with the designated scenic corridor, and the height of the architectural element poses additional impact to neighbors' views. At the second neighborhood meeting, the applicant presented a version of the design that incorporated a five foot high brick architectural element. The five foot high brick architectural element was supported by neighbors and staff.

The maximum building height in the C-1 Commercial District is twenty-five feet. As noted in the Zoning Code, "Architectural elements may exceed this limitation by no more than ten (10) feet, subject to approval by the CDRB." A condition to revise the architectural element to a five foot high, brick element has been added to Attachment 1.

3. *Façade articulation: all building facades shall be fully articulated, including variation in building massing, roof planes, wall planes, and surface articulation. Architectural elements including, but not limited to; overhangs, trellises, projections, awnings, insets, material, and texture shall be used to create visual interest that contribute to a building's character.*

All facades incorporate building massing; however, the middle portion of the eastern façade has a large, blank expanse that requires additional wall plane articulation. Surface articulation is provided by windows and cut-outs in the massing elements. Additional variation in the roof parapet is required to meet this standard. These requirements are discussed under B. Addendum A Design Standards, below.

4. *Screening: building design and screening strategies shall be implemented to conceal the view of loading areas, refuse enclosures, mechanical equipment, appurtenances, and utilities from adjacent public streets and neighborhoods.*

The mechanical units are located on the building roof and must be screened by building form where possible, or by clustered screening. The drawing that is provided of the rooftop view is not adequate to evaluate the view of the mechanical equipment from the adjacent neighborhood, and does not include the required screening around clusters of mechanical equipment. The drawing does indicate that the rooftop is proposed to be painted a medium earth tone color that will help the rooftop to recede from view. The screening of the rooftop mechanical equipment must be addressed to the satisfaction of the CDRB. A revised drawing demonstrating and detailing adequate screening of the rooftop mechanical equipment is required. A condition is added to Attachment 1.

Refuse areas must be screened with a 6-foot opaque screen painted to match the buildings. The design does not include details for this screening. A condition has been added to address this requirement.

B. Addendum A Design Standards

The following Design Standards are relevant to this project:

- 2.2.B.2. *Parapets shall contain varied rooflines and/or incorporation of sloped roof elements. Parapets shall incorporate design elements, including pre-cast elements, projecting cornices, lentils and caps.*

The roof should be designed to incorporate variation in the parapet profile in accordance with this standard. A condition has been added to Attachment 1 to require that additional parapet variation be added to all elevations.

- 2.2.D.1. *Moderate development to reduce apparent scale and mass. Consistent roof plane variation, wall plane articulation and consistent architectural treatment is required on all exterior facades to reduce scale and mass and provide visual interest. . .*

Additional articulation should be added to the wall on the eastern elevation to meet this standard. A condition has been added to Attachment 1.

- 2.2.D.1.f. *Ground level facades that face public streets and/or primary parking areas shall have one-story pedestrian-scale features on at least 2/3 of the horizontal length of the side of a building. Features may include windows, entry areas, arcades and/or overhangs (awnings, trellis, etc).*

The front (west) elevation is the primary pedestrian area at this building. The architectural design for the west elevation includes shade devices at windows. However, the western exposure of this elevation merits additional shading. Staff suggests a shaded colonnade or other architectural enhancement. A condition has been added to Attachment 1 for additional shading along the western elevation.

- 2.2.E.3. *Primary colors should be used judiciously and as accents only.*

According to this standard, the use of white as an accent is acceptable; however, a Light Reflectivity Value for the paint selection should be specified to minimize glare to the extent feasible, while still maintaining the color as an accent. A condition has been added to Attachment 1.

- Section 2.2.E12, *At least three (3) substantially different materials shall be utilized on all facades of the building.*

The west façade incorporates two shades of split face block, a third shade of smooth block, and two shades of brick veneer, in similar shades but a different pattern from the block. The north, east, and south facades incorporate two shades of split face block, a third shade of smooth block, and stucco. All facades incorporate cornice and trim; the cornice material is not specified, but its appearance is distinct from the other materials. Staff concludes the above standard is met.

CONCLUSION/RECOMMENDATION:

The Conceptual Architecture is not yet in substantial conformance with the Conceptual Design Principles and Design Standards. Any recommendation for approval should be subject to conditions requiring specific modifications:

- The ten foot high crown architectural element shall be revised to a five foot high brick element.
- Rooftop screening shall be implemented/confirmed to conceal the view of mechanical equipment from adjacent neighbors.

- The roof shall be designed to incorporate variation in the parapet profile.
- Additional articulation shall be provided on the eastern elevation wall.
- Additional shading should be added on the western elevation.

SUGGESTED MOTION:

The CDRB may wish to consider one of the following suggested motions:

I move to approve the Conceptual Architecture for LA Fitness subject to the Conditions in Attachment 1, Part II, finding that with the conditions:

- The Conceptual Architecture meets the applicable Conceptual Design Review Principles.
- The Conceptual Architecture has sufficiently addressed substantive neighborhood issues and concerns, thereby improving community fit.

OR

I move to deny the Conceptual Architecture for LA Fitness, finding that:

- The Conceptual Architecture does not meet the applicable design Review Principles including: _____.
- The Conceptual Architecture does not sufficiently address substantive neighborhood issues and concerns, including: _____.

SECTION IV: PUBLIC ARTWORK

The proposed public artwork is a fifteen foot high metal sculpture titled "Go Figure." The piece is comprised of three six-sided, curved, quadrangular shapes with flared ends. The material is stainless steel, and two of the shapes would be heat-colored to blue and bronze hues. The sculpture sits atop a cylindrical metal base. According to the applicant's narrative, the shape evokes an hourglass figure. The narrative further notes the shapes are intended to be independent, yet interconnected; the evocation of a connected mind, body, and spirit is suggested.

The artwork is located in the pedestrian area at the southwest corner of the building.

A. Oro Valley Zoning Code Revised, Section 27.3.H. Review Criteria.

Following are the Section 27.3.H. Review Criteria (*in italics*) followed by staff evaluation of how the public artwork conforms and responds to the criteria:

1. Public art should serve as a distinctive and integral element in the overall design of a project or development.

The public artwork is fifteen feet high. In the context of this large building, the work will be visible to most visitors entering the front entrance of the center. The blue and bronze colors will help the artwork to stand out from the building.

2. Public art should relate to the context and character of the project. Where appropriate, public art may employ themes associated with the activities within the development.

The public artwork is an abstract figure. The applicant notes that the polished, colored stainless forms will be an appropriate counterpoint to the textured building surfaces. The applicant's narrative indicates that the sculpture is intended to evoke an uplifting theme. The "Mind/Body/Spirit" reference relates to the proposed use: physical fitness.

3. Public art should relate to the historical, cultural or natural context of the project area, the neighborhood or the Town.

The proposed sculpture does not specifically reference these themes.

4. Public art shall not include corporate advertising elements of a business including colors, graphics, logos, or other representations of corporate identity.

An on-line search indicates that the proposed design includes some elements that are similar to the LA Fitness corporate logo. The logo colors are navy blue and gold (see Attachment 6).

5. Public art shall be designed to prevent hazards to the public. Durability and safety of materials shall be considered including potential areas of excessive wear or damage, which shall be mitigated.

The applicant's narrative notes that the artwork will be structurally sound and connected to the base, and that the material is extremely durable.

6. Potential obstructions, including landscape materials at maturity or future construction, shall be considered when locating public art.

The public artwork location is not included in the landscape plan. A condition has been added to add the public artwork to the plan. It appears that some plant materials, such as trees, may need to be repositioned to afford optimal view of the sculpture from the building entry and pedestrian area.

7. Public art shall be original and not duplicate existing artwork in the Town and shall conform to community standards.

The artists' description notes that this is a unique piece of art commissioned for this project.

B. Addendum A Design Standards

- Design Standard 2.2.G.1. *Public art shall be integrated into the overall design of the project and shall be located in areas of high visibility and use such as courtyards, seating areas, and along public roadways.*

The proposed sculpture is proposed to be relocated from the southeast corner of the site to the southwest corner of the western building façade, where it will be visible to many visitors. There is limited pedestrian area around the building, and the art is integrated with the overall design. The public artwork meets the standard of being located in an area of high visibility and use. A condition is added to Attachment 1 to update the revised public artwork location on the Site Plan.

CONCLUSION/RECOMMENDATION:

The proposed Conceptual Artwork is an original, freestanding sculpture. The updated location in the pedestrian area at the southwest corner of the building is acceptable. The Conceptual Public Artwork is in substantial conformance with several Zoning Code Review Criteria and Design Standards. Any recommendation for approval should be subject to the conditions in Attachment 1, Part III.

SUGGESTED MOTION:

The CDRB may wish to consider one of the following suggested motions:

I move to approve the Conceptual Public Artwork for LA Fitness with the Conditions in Attachment 1, Part III, finding that the proposed Conceptual Public Artwork meets the applicable Zoning Code Review Criteria.

OR

I move to deny the Conceptual Public Artwork for LA Fitness, finding that:

- The artwork does not meet the design criteria due to the inclusion of design elements that are similar to the LA Fitness logo.
- Other: _____.

Attachments:

1. Conditions of Approval
2. Conceptual Site Plan & Conceptual Landscape Plan
3. Neighborhood Meeting: Issues and Concerns
4. Conceptual Architecture
5. Conceptual Public Artwork
6. LA Fitness Logo

Project Manager: Karen Berchtold, AICP, Senior Planner

David Williams, AICP, Planning Division Manager

cc: Greg Gill
Jorge Calderon
Steve Haney

**Attachment 1
Conditions of Approval
LA Fitness Conceptual Design Review**

Part I: Conceptual Site Plan (OV1211-08)

Engineering:

1. Address all redlined comments within the Conceptual Site Plan and Conceptual Landscape Plan.
2. Provide a Traffic Impact Analysis (TIA) for this project. The original TIA that was created for the Eckerd Development dated June 2003 is no longer valid for this proposal. At a minimum, the following information is required to be updated for the TIA for review prior to the Town Council hearing:
 - Site plan to match proposed layout
 - Traffic volumes
 - Capacity calculations
 - Trip generation and distribution
 - Left- and right-turn analyses for the proposed driveways and existing left-turn pockets.
3. An updated TIA is required before Town staff can approve the proposed location of the Hardy Road access driveway connection. The access drive intersection with Hardy Road may need to shift further east so that adequate space is provided to accommodate the two required back-to-back left-turn storage lanes along Hardy Road.
4. Sheet 2: Provide a turn around area at the end of the dead end parking lot near the southeast corner of the building. A striped out parking space can be utilized to satisfy this requirement.

Planning:

1. Conceptual Site Plan must be revised to show the updated location of the public artwork.
2. Conceptual Site Plan must be revised to address staff comments in January 6, 2012 letter, which includes the following Zoning Code requirements:
 - A passenger drop off area must be provided.
 - A pedestrian area with benches and shading must be provided. Benches must function in concert with landscape design to achieve shading, or structural solution may be provided.
 - A forty-two inch high, masonry wall and/or depressed parking, or combination, must be provided for the parking spaces facing Hardy Road.
 - Confirm that requirement for ten foot wide landscaping is met for western building elevation.
4. For the final Landscape Plan, plant types will be selected that include color, visual interest, and height.
5. For the Improvement Plans and Final Landscape Plan, the channel along Hardy Road shall be designed to preserve existing vegetation to the greatest extent feasible.
6. For the Final Site Plan, a six foot high screen wall with view panels located in the middle of a thirty foot wide landscape buffer will be provided at the eastern property boundary.
7. Wall-mounted lighting will be ten feet high or lower, and pole-mounted lighting within 150 feet of residential property must be fifteen feet high or lower, with cut-off fixtures.
8. The refuse container must be relocated to the northwest corner of the northern parking lot.
9. Prior to review by Town Council, any outstanding agency comments must be addressed.

Part II: Conceptual Architecture (OV1311-15)

1. Details must be provided for six foot high screening of refuse areas.
2. Specify cornice material on materials sheet.
3. A plan depicting the view of the rooftop mechanical equipment from the adjacent neighborhood, with required screening to conceal the equipment must be submitted for review and approval of staff.

4. The architectural element must be revised to a maximum five foot high, brick architectural element.
5. Additional wall plane articulation must be added to the eastern elevation of the building to meet Design Standard 2.2.D.1.
6. Additional variation in parapet height must be added to all elevations to meet Design Standard 2.2.B.2.
7. Additional shading must be added to the western elevation to meet Design Standard 2.2.D.1.f.
8. The Light Reflectivity Value of the white accent paint must be provided.

Part III: Conceptual Public Artwork (OV512-001)

1. A drawing indicating the location of public artwork must be provided.

