

TOWN OF ORO VALLEY

CONCEPTUAL DESIGN REVIEW BOARD

MEETING DATE: April 10, 2012

TO: CONCEPTUAL DESIGN REVIEW BOARD

FROM: Matt Michels, AICP, Senior Planner

SUBJECT: **Conceptual Site Plan, Conceptual Architecture, and Alternative Parking Ratio for the Encantada at Steam Pump apartments**, located on the west side of Oracle Road and south of Rams Field Pass, OV1212-01.

SUMMARY:

This project entails development of a 288 unit apartment complex consisting of twelve (12) 24-unit apartment buildings with a clubhouse/office and a publicly accessible coffee house adjacent to the clubhouse/office. Access to the site is provided from two driveways onto Oracle Road and a cross-connection from Phase III of Steam Pump Village to the south. A signal at the intersection of Oracle Road and Rams Field Pass is anticipated.

This review entails both the Conceptual Site Plan and Conceptual Architecture. Conceptual public art is not included in this review and will be presented separately at a later date. The CDRB review is focused on the fundamental elements of the design, including: site layout; circulation; parking; landscape concept (please note that the Conceptual Landscape Plan (Attachment #4) reflects a previous building layout. The current building layout is contained in the attached Conceptual Site Plan (Attachment #2); and conceptual grading and drainage information. The information must be sufficient to demonstrate that the design concept is achievable and to ensure community fit.

Many important design issues raised by Town staff and the neighbors, including site layout, viewshed protection, lighting, bufferyards, and access, have been integrated into the design of the project. Some of the more specific issues, such as lighting pole height and screening design, will be evaluated during the Final Design phase. The Conceptual Site Plan and Conceptual Architecture have been evaluated for conformance to the Design Principles found in Section 22.5.D.5 of the Zoning Code and the Design Standards found in Addendum "A".

This report contains staff analysis, proposed conditions of approval and suggested motions for the Conceptual Site Plan and Conceptual Architecture. The Conceptual Design Principles are utilized as primary guidance for Staff and CDRB evaluation of the applications. The Addendum "A" Design Standards are used as secondary guidance, as appropriate.

SECTION I: BACKGROUND

Site Conditions

- Site is 13.03 acres (apartment site is 12.03 acres and coffee shop site is 1 acre)
- Zoning is Steam Pump Village Planned Area Development (PAD)
- Commercial uses (retail, restaurant and hotel) and Basis Charter School are located in proximity to this project
- Proposed uses include apartment complex with associated facilities and publicly-accessible coffee house
- Property is currently vacant
- Site slopes generally from north to south
- Steam Pump Village PAD is exempt from Oracle Road Scenic Corridor Overlay District (ORSCOD)

Proposed Improvements

- Twelve (12) 24-unit apartment buildings; 1-3 bedroom units
- Allowed building height:
 - Up to 100' from Oracle road - 30'
 - 100'-150' from Oracle Rd. - 39'
 - 150'+ from Oracle Rd. - 49' (including architectural elements)
- Proposed building height: 34', three stories
- The project is in conformance with the PAD setback requirements, specifically a 120' average setback from Oracle Road and rear setback of 30'.
 - Nearest residence located west of the project is approximately 1000'.
 - Nearest residence located east of the project (across Oracle Rd.) is approximately 450'.
- 482 parking spaces based on an Alternative Parking Analysis (1.67 spaces/unit; see Attachment #3).
 - The PAD does not have a residential parking standard. Therefore, Zoning Code standards apply. The applicant has requested an alternative parking ratio as described above.
- At least 20% landscaped open space is required by the PAD.
- Landscape concept includes:
 - All plants from Steam Pump Village PAD approved plant list
 - Required buffer yard plantings on front of property
 - Landscaping in rainwater harvesting basins
 - Meandering curvilinear screen wall at front of property
- Rainwater harvesting basins located throughout the site

Approvals to Date

- Steam Pump Village PAD approved August 10, 1988 (Ordinance (O) 88-171)
- PAD amended on April 20, 2011 (Ordinance (O) 11-11), which included provision for 12 acres of multi-family residential with up to 300 units

Surrounding Land Uses

| Direction | Land Use | Zoning |
|-----------|---|--|
| North | Town-owned open space parcel | Steam Pump PAD |
| South | Basis Charter School | Steam Pump PAD |
| East | Public Storage Facility Big Horn Commerce Commercial Ctr. (vacant); Single Family Residential | La Reserve PAD, CPI Oro Valley C-2 La Reserve PAD, residential |
| West | CDO Wash | R1-144 |

SECTION II: CONCEPTUAL SITE PLAN

A. Oro Valley Zoning Code

The Conceptual Site Plan is in substantial conformance with all applicable zoning code requirements. The following is a list of noteworthy items:

1. Alternative Parking Compliance: Per Section 27.7.C.2, the Conceptual Design Review Board (CDRB) may approve an alternative parking ratio to the attached dwelling parking standards found in Table 27-13 of the Zoning Code (see Attached Dwelling Parking table, below):

Attached Dwelling Parking

| Number of Bedrooms | Parking Spaces Per Dwelling |
|--------------------|-----------------------------|
| One or less | 1.5 |
| Two | 1.75 |
| Three | 2.0 |

Plus one (1) space per every four (4) units for guest parking

The CDRB’s review of Alternative Parking Compliance is based on the following criteria:

- a. Review Criteria: To approve an alternative plan, the Conceptual Design Review Board must find that the proposed alternative plan accomplishes the purpose of this section equally well or better than the standards of this section. The Conceptual Design Review Board shall consider:
 - i. The number of employees occupying the building or land use and the number of expected customers or clients.
 - ii. The availability of nearby parking (if any).
 - iii. Purchased or leased parking spaces in a municipal or private parking lot meeting the requirements of the Town; trip reduction programs (if any).
 - iv. Any other factors that may be unique to the applicant’s development request.
 - v. Continuity and convenient proximity for pedestrians between or among existing or future uses in the vicinity.
 - vi. Visual and aesthetic impact along the public street by placing parking lots to the rear or alongside of buildings, to the maximum extent feasible. Visual and aesthetic impact of the surrounding neighborhood.
 - vii. Impact on any facilities serving alternative modes of transportation.
 - viii. Impact on natural areas or features.
 - ix. Maintenance of mobility-impaired parking ratios.

The applicant has provided an alternative parking analysis (see Attachment #3) describing how the aforementioned criteria have been met. Their proposed parking standard of 1.67 spaces/unit is based on the applicant’s long-term experience with multi-family projects they have developed and managed.

B. Steam Pump Village PAD

The Conceptual Site Plan is in substantial conformance with Steam Pump Village PAD development requirements and design guidelines. Following are key design guidelines (*in italics*), followed by staff evaluation of how the site design addresses the principles:

1. Section 1.3.A.1: “...*provide visual relief to avoid bulk concerns.*”

The placement of several buildings around linear pockets of open space, including between Buildings #2, 3, and 4 and a larger area between Building #6, 8, 9, and 10, serve to provide swaths of open space that provide visual relief within the site. The site design could benefit from more staggered setbacks or other angulation of the buildings to add additional visual relief. However, moving the buildings could result in less usable open space between buildings.

2. Section 1.3.A.6.e” “...provide visual...access to the open space mesquite bosque” located adjacent to the north end of the project.

The Town-owned mesquite bosque parcel will be highly visible from the northern side of the property and the northern entrance near the proposed signal at Ram’s Field Pass. The applicant has agreed to improve the parcel and provide public and apartment resident access. Staff has added a condition to Attachment #1.

C. Oro Valley Zoning Code Conceptual Site Design Principles, Section 22.9.D.5.a.

The Conceptual Site Plan is in substantial conformance with all applicable Conceptual Site Design Principles. Following are key Design Principles (*in italics*), followed by staff evaluation of how the site design addresses the principles:

1. *Building orientation: the location, orientation and size of structures shall promote a complementary relationship of structures to one another.*

The buildings have been placed and oriented on the site to efficiently utilize the property and maximize density and accessibility. Due to the high density and verticality of the 3 story buildings, several design strategies have been implemented to improve the “complimentary relationship of structures to one another.” These include placing the buildings at angles on the site to reduce appearance of bulk and provide visual variety. The overall design aims to avoid a linear “barracks” appearance.

2. *Drainage/grading: site grading shall minimize impacts on natural grade and landforms and provide for subtle transitions of architectural elements to grade. Significant cuts and fills in relation to natural grade shall be avoided or minimized to the extent practical given property constraints.*

The site is generally flat. No major cuts or fills will be required. The site will be lowered approximately 8 feet on the eastern side adjacent to Oracle Road to match the grade of property to the south. This will further reduce the visual impact of the project from Oracle Road and nearby neighborhoods.

3. *Connectivity: strengthen the usability and connectivity of the pedestrian environment internally and externally by enhancing access to the public street system, transit, adjoining development and pedestrian and bicycle transportation routes. Where appropriate, buildings and uses should provide access to adjacent open space and recreational areas.*

The internal pedestrian facilities for this project are intended to bring residents and visitors from the parking areas along the perimeter to the building entrances and from the buildings to the open space/recreation areas and the clubhouse/pool and coffee house. Two pedestrian connections to the CDO trail and a pedestrian connection to the Steam Pump Village to the south will be provided. The placement of buildings serves to create nodes of usable open space on the site.

A condition requiring a sidewalk along Oracle Road, as required by the PAD, has been added to Attachment #1. In addition, an additional pedestrian connection to Phase III of Steam Pump Village to the south and a pedestrian connection to the mesquite bosque park has been added.

D. Addendum A Design Standards

The Conceptual Site Plan is in substantial conformance with all applicable Design Standards. Following are notable Design Standards (*in italics*), followed by staff evaluation of how the site design addresses the standards:

- Section 4.1.A.2.c, *Open space shall be used to enhance the community through use of one or more of the following design strategies: c. Place pockets of landscaped open space or common areas between buildings and to provide a serene, attractive residential atmosphere.*

The design includes several nodes of usable, meaningful open space between buildings to provide for active and passive recreation and gatherings, with the largest area between Buildings #6, 8, 9, and 10. The PAD requires 20% minimum landscaped open space, which will be met.

- Section 4.1.H, *Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design (CPTED)*

The site has been designed to consider natural surveillance by placing common areas and recreational features in highly visible locations. The “eyes on the street” deter illicit or unauthorized activities. Access to the residential portion of the property will be controlled to limit access to residents and authorized guests.

- Section 4.3.B, *Landscape Themes and Character. Landscaping shall enhance visual character and provide amenities for pedestrians.*

Project and building entrances will be enhanced with landscaping and trees and plant materials will be used to create shade for pedestrians. Overall, the project will provide a substantial number of canopy shade trees and understory plants to soften the appearance of the project and provide shade.

E. Engineering Division Comments

DRAINAGE

The project site is located within the undeveloped fourth phase of Steam Pump Village. Existing stormwater runoff flows through the site in a northeast to southwest direction. The runoff is directed into an existing network of catch basins and storm drains immediately north of the Basis School site. The storm drain system discharges the collected stormwater runoff into the existing Steam Pump Village detention basin located west of Baggins. The detention basin functions to attenuate stormwater discharge for the Steam Pump Village development and ultimately discharges into the Foothills Channel which feeds into the Canada del Oro Wash.

The proposed drainage improvements will include extending the existing storm drain system as intended per the original master drainage report for Steam Pump Village. The new improvements shall be designed to work within the constraints of the original master drainage report, the Town’s Drainage Criteria Manual and Floodplain Ordinance. Furthermore, additional detention storage shall be required with this project to mitigate off-site stormwater runoff from the open space parcel that adjoins the development to the north

The use of rainwater harvesting basins and first flush treatment will be incorporated into the final design in accordance with Town requirements. First flush treatment is designed to capture sediment, debris, trash, oils, and grease within runoff discharging from parking areas and access drives.

GRADING

A Type 2 Grading Permit is required to construct the building pad, drainage structures, utilities, parking lot, and any other structures requiring grading on the project site. The grading represented within the Conceptual Site Plan conforms to the requirements of the Steam Pump PAD, Chapter 27.9 of the Town's Zoning Code, and the Town's Subdivision Street Standards.

TRAFFIC

The proposed development will be accessed via three locations: an existing access driveway turnout from Oracle Road, the existing Rams Field Pass intersection, and from within the Steam Pump Village development. The access driveway along Oracle Road will be limited to right-in/out traffic movements while the Rams Field Pass intersection will be full access. A Traffic Impact Analysis (TIA) was prepared for this project. The TIA identifies several recommended improvements along Oracle Road to mitigate traffic impacts such as a traffic signal at the Oracle Road/Rams Field Pass intersection.

All required off-site roadway improvements shall be the responsibility of the developer. All constructed improvements within the Oracle Road right-of-way will require a separate permit issued from the Arizona Department of Transportation.

CONCLUSION/RECOMMENDATION:

Based on a review of relevant standards, staff finds that the Conceptual Site Plan is in substantial conformance with the Zoning Code, Steam Pump Village PAD, Design Principles and applicable Design Standards. The proposed development is adequately separated and screened from homes to the east and west and from Oracle Road and will be generally compatible with the existing area, including existing development at Steam Pump Village to the south. The project includes pedestrian connectivity to and within the site, to the CDO trail, and internally with development to the south. Staff recommends approval of the Conceptual Site Plan subject to the attached conditions in Part I of the Conditions of Approval (see Attachment #1).

SUGGESTED MOTION:

The CDRB may wish to consider one of the following suggested motions:

I move to recommend [approval OR approval with conditions] of the Conceptual Site Plan and approve the alternative Parking Analysis for Encantada at Steam Pump Village, subject to the conditions of Part I in Attachment #1, finding that:

- The proposed Conceptual Site Plan meets the applicable Zoning Code Review criteria.
- The proposed Conceptual Site Plan meets the applicable Steam Pump Village PAD criteria.

OR

I move to recommend denial of the Conceptual Site Plan and deny the Alternative Parking Analysis for Encantada at Steam Pump Village apartments, finding that the proposal does not meet the applicable Zoning Code Review Criteria.

SECTION III: CONCEPTUAL ARCHITECTUREA. Oro Valley Zoning Code Conceptual Architectural Design Principles, Section 22.9.D.5.b.

The Conceptual Architecture (see Attachment #5) for the buildings is in substantial conformance with the Architectural Design Principles. Staff has proposed conditions to meet Conceptual Architectural Design Principles and Standards. Following are the Design Principles (*in italics*) followed by staff evaluation of how the architecture conforms and responds to the principles:

1. *Design: building architectural design shall be appropriate for the climate and characteristics of the Sonoran Desert, including indigenous and traditional textures, colors, and shapes found in and around Oro Valley. All development shall maintain and strengthen the high quality of design exemplified in Oro Valley through project creativity and design excellence.*

The buildings incorporate traditional and contemporary Southwestern elements, shapes, and textures, sloped and flat roof planes, architecturally appropriate multi-light windows with pop-outs and lintels, and the use of traditional roof tile and stucco finish. The entries to the stair wells are well defined with the extensive use of stone veneer. The architectural design is appropriate for the area and is compatible with surrounding development.

2. *Scale, height and mass: building scale, height and mass shall be consistent with the town-approved intensity of the site, designated scenic corridors, and valued mountain views. Buildings shall be designed to respect the scale of adjoining areas and should mitigate the negative and functional impacts that arise from scale, bulk and mass.*

The project area includes the Basis Charter School to the south, other commercial development within Steam Pump Village and employment and commercial development across Oracle Road. The scale, height, and mass of the project is appropriate for this portion of the Oracle Road corridor. The applicant has proposed steps to mitigate impacts of the development, including the addition of additional canopy trees along the western side of the development and reducing light pole height, as needed, to minimize lighting impacts on adjacent residential areas. The primary views from adjacent homes are towards the Catalinas and Pusch Ridge to the southeast. The project will not significantly impede these primary views from nearby residences to the west.

3. *Façade articulation: all building facades shall be fully articulated, including variation in building massing, roof planes, wall planes, and surface articulation. Architectural elements including, but not limited to; overhangs, trellises, projections, awnings, insets, material, and texture shall be used to create visual interest that contribute to a building's character.*

All elevations of the building façade are generally well articulated through the use of varying roof and wall planes and surface articulation around windows and door openings. Staff has worked with the applicant to include architectural features that were not originally included, including the stone veneer wainscot, contrasting banding between floors, deeper/more defined eaves (18" deep) and exposed rafter tails along the fascia of the horizontal roof elements. These features serve to enhance the architecture and make the project more appropriate and compatible with existing buildings at Steam Pump Village.

4. *Screening: building design and screening strategies shall be implemented to conceal the view of loading areas, refuse enclosures, mechanical equipment, appurtenances, and utilities from adjacent public streets and neighborhoods.*

All mechanical units will be screened by a parapet wall. No mechanical equipment, refuse enclosures, appurtenances, or utilities will be visible from adjacent residences or Oracle Road. A 5' screen wall with landscaping is included along Oracle Road to screen parking from Oracle Road, with the exception of the clubhouse, office and coffee shop, which may be reduced in height.

Refuse areas must be screened with a 6-foot opaque screen painted to match the buildings. The design does not include details for this screening, but will be required at the final design phase. Please note that the refuse containers along Oracle Road will be approximately eight (8') below grade and will be largely concealed from view from the roadway. A condition has been added to Attachment #1 to further mitigate possible view of the trash enclosures from Oracle Road with additional vegetation.

B. Addendum A Design Standards

The Conceptual Architecture is in substantial conformance with all applicable Design Standards. Following are notable Design Standards (*in italics*), followed by staff evaluation of how the architecture addresses the standards:

- Section 4.2.A.3.a. *Project design shall consider and integrate all elements by: (1) Provide consistent architectural treatments, articulation, and fenestration to present a coherent design theme for all sides of a building.*

The overall design of the buildings present a coherent theme on all four sides of the building. There is some concern that the repetition of the same color and material palettes will appear monotonous. Staff recommends that at least 3 color palettes be used to add variety to the project. A condition has been added to Attachment #1 to address this concern.

- Section 4.1.B.1, *Multi-family residential developments shall provide well defined entry features at all major entrances...*

The project will have two entry points from Oracle Road and an entry from Steam Pump Village on the south. The project entry will feature a monument sign and the walls will be designed to help to define the project identity and create a sense of arrival with themed landscaping elements.

The applicant will need to provide a primary entry feature that coordinates with other entries into Steam Pump Village. A condition has been added to Attachment #1 to address this requirement.

- Section 4.2.A.3.d, *Rooftop mechanical equipment, vents and ducts shall be screened or painted to match the roof color and building architecture and shall not be visible generally...*

The conceptual elevations do not indicate where rooftop mechanical equipment will be installed and how units will be screened. A rooftop parapet is provided, and must be sufficient to conceal the mechanical equipment from view from residences and public streets. Staff has added a condition to Attachment #1 to require that this be added.

- Section 4.2.C.1.b and c, *Emphasize the horizontal, but break up long, continuous building surfaces with off-sets or contrasting forms at regular intervals along the primary façade. Vary roofline silhouettes.*

The buildings incorporate sloped and flat roof elements around the perimeter of the buildings. The design adds visual interest and variety to the building.

All buildings will incorporate a stone veneer wainscot along all facades of the buildings to better define and add visual interest to the pedestrian level. In addition, the stairwell entry areas will all have full stone veneer from ground level to the top of the buildings to define the entry points. Staff recommends that horizontal banding be provided between the first and second floors of the buildings to offset the verticality of the buildings which is accentuated by the stone around the stairwell entry porticos.

- Section 4.2.C.2.a and b, *Multi-family residential building materials shall be of high quality and proven durability in the Sonoran Desert environment. Permitted primary materials include...cement hard coat stucco...natural or simulated (cultured) stone...*

As discussed, the buildings will have a large amount of stone veneer around the first level wainscot and around the stairwell entry porticos.

- Section 4.2.F.1.a, *Provide shade for exterior walls, especially on the south and west elevations, through the use of roof overhangs, exterior shading devices or inset windows.*

While portions of the buildings will have exterior shading around the patio areas, staff has added a condition to Attachment #1 requiring shade structures or additional canopy trees on all west facing facades on Buildings #3, 7, 9, and 11 to address heat gain concerns and to limit lighting and privacy impacts on neighbors to the west.

CONCLUSION/RECOMMENDATION:

The Conceptual Architecture is in substantial conformance with the Design Standards. Staff recommends approval subject to Part II of Attachment #1.

SUGGESTED MOTION:

The CDRB may wish to consider one of the following suggested motions:

I move to recommend [approval OR approval with conditions] of the Conceptual Architecture for Encantada at Steam Pump Village apartments, subject to Part II in Attachment #1, finding that:

- The proposed Conceptual Public Architecture meets the applicable Zoning Code Review criteria.

OR

I move to recommend denial of the Conceptual Architecture for Encantada at Steam Pump Village apartments, finding that the proposal does not meet applicable Zoning Code Review criteria and standards.

SECTION IV: PUBLIC NOTIFICATION AND COMMENT:

Notice to the public was provided consistent with Town-adopted noticing procedures, which includes the following:

- Notification of residents within 1000, plus the entire Rams Field and Rams Canyon subdivisions (260 residents total)
- Posting at Town Hall
- All registered HOAs

A neighborhood meeting was held on January 23, 2012. Approximately 10 residents attended this meeting. A summary of the neighborhood meeting is attached for your reference (see Attachment #6). All applicable comments and concerns, including concerns related to vegetative screening and architectural variety, have been addressed on the Conceptual Site Plan and Architecture or added as conditions of approval. One letter in opposition has been received regarding the Conceptual Site Plan (see Attachment #7).

Attachments:

1. Conditions of Approval
2. Conceptual Site Plan
3. Alternative Parking Analysis
4. Conceptual Landscape Plan
5. Conceptual Architecture
6. Neighborhood Meeting Summary
7. Anders Letter

cc: Teresa Vasquez, HSL Properties, teresav@hslproperties.com
Mike Censky, HSL Properties, mcensky@hslproperties.com
Allison Reis, Evergreen DevCo, Allison.Reis@Evergreendev.com
Mark Weinberg, Diamond Ventures, mweinberg@diamondven.com
Paul Oland, WLB, gpoland@wlbgroup.com
David Little, WLB, dlittle@wlbgroup.com